

PROPOSAL TO THE MARCHING AFFAIRS COMMITTEE

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION

CLASSIFICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE STUDY RELATED TO CLASSIFICATION BY BAND SIZE

BASIS FOR STUDY: A proposal was submitted by Sean Cartner of Conifer HS to create more equity for smaller programs by reclassifying Colorado Bands by band size vs school size.

RECOMMENDATION: It was determined at the December 9, 2023 Marching Affairs Meeting to not vote on this until further work was done to evaluate the impact of such a decision.

COMMITTEE: A Classification Review Committee (CRC) was formed to include the proposal author (Sean Cartner) and directors representing all class sizes and state demographics. Members included Rick Shaw (Chairman), WL Whaley (Co-Chair), Sean Cartner, Becky Paschke, Sean Hedding, Benjamin Corneliusen, Trey Tafoya, Tyler VanDermeer, Ryan Crabtree, Bryce Melaragno, Aaron Herman, Stoney Black.

The committee was given the task to gather as much information from other directors statewide on the topic and what change should be considered if any.

FEBRUARY REVIEW: Information was gathered in a Google sheet as a collection tool to assess common concerns and thoughts. Each of the areas were discussed at the February 19 CRC meeting.

What's Best For Kids

Theme and Consensus - Strong and positive instruction, better understanding of the system, and giving a larger percentage of 1A, 2A, 3A programs a chance at the State Championship experience.

Information gathered reflected that the conversation should focus on a bigger problem - the direction should lead to conversations around more equity rather than reclassification. Maybe the school size/band size is not the problem, maybe how we run the circuit and how we run events etc. is the problem.

Sean Cartner **withdrew his proposal to classification by band size with the understanding to discuss other equitable options.** CRC agreed to keeping our classification as School Size, and conversation should now shift to equitable practices to make our competitions and season more achievable across the board - scheduling blocks, locations, etc.

NEXT STEPS:

There is a need for best practices, understanding and director education.

More discussion required of the 13-minute 1A-3A slots.

More discussion on weighted draws.

Complete a Google Form related to a variety of ways to slot bands at our events.

MARCH REVIEW: Information from the February Google form was discussed. Topics on this form included:

- What should a CBA sanctioned show look like?
- Would changing the draw from 4 band to blocks of 6 or 8 be more equitable?
- Should shows that are by class draw for class order?
- Should a 13 minute slot for 1A-3A be considered for all CBA shows?
- Regional format be a random draw of remain reverse order?
- What would this look like for Quarter-Finals, Semi-Finals, Finals?

The discussion of these items was approached with the understanding that CBA's philosophy revolves around not dictating specifics on format of sanctioned shows. Any change to how a show is scheduled could have a financial impact on the host and CBA should only offer the considerations of the committee review and allow festivals to make decisions that are best for their event.

Should CBA adopt a 13-minute time slot for 1A-3A bands, this would only be scheduled as such in shows that are scheduled by class. All Open Class Shows should be scheduled in 15-minute slots regardless of class.

CBA should recommend to the show hosts that class winners be included in the finals either as part of the competition or offered an exhibition performance slot. It is understood that each show has its limitations and adding to the schedule may not be possible.

Considering a total random draw or draws in blocks of 6 or 8 only makes the problem worse and adds to the potential of judging inequities/inconsistency. Draws in blocks of 4 should be the way CBA proceeds.

“Director Education” is an area CBA should continue to explore so directors can best understand judging and how everything works. It was revealed that something many directors need to understand is how judges think about performance order and even reverse order in finals - comparing bands to bands and really getting a good feel from slot to slot. We need to teach our directors to trust the process & how to understand it better.

A 13-minute scheduling model for 1A-3A Semi-finals and Finals was reviewed and showed how 2 bands in each class could be added to Semi-finals and 1 band in each class for Finals. The impact on the current schedule would only be an addition of 5 minutes to the day.

A change from reverse order scheduling at Quarterfinals had been previously rejected at the December MAC meeting. Semi-Finals and Finals should remain the same and was agreed upon.

APRIL REVIEW:

A review of the achievability and positive impact of moving to 13 min slots for 1A-3A by allowing more programs the ability to be involved in the State Championship event. The discussion led to moving the pre-stage time up as well as the impact on warm-up times. The determination was made that 13-minute slots would have no impact on these aspects.

A review of the times used at regionals in 2023 by bands in the small classes showed that every band except three were off the field at under 13 minutes. Again, minimal to no impact of moving to 13 minutes. The CRC supported a move to this slotting format to begin in 2024.

Offer the CRC the opportunity to revisit any areas that were tabled in previous discussions or topics that were not given a fair amount of attention. The committee had no areas of concern and moved forward with allowing for a proposal to be submitted to the Marching Affairs Committee.

The CRC in its entirety was congratulated on the depth and professional work that was completed in this process.

RECOMMENDATION FOR APPROVAL:

April 2, 2024

- 1) CBA will continue to classify bands based on school size.
- 2) As a result of the CRC study, CBA Marching Committee should not reevaluate such a proposal again for a minimum of five years.
- 3) The Chairman of Marching Affairs will visit with every CBA sanctioned show host and share the findings of the CRC study and request but not require:
 - a. Shows that are based on Classes should consider rotating the order or draw the order of Class performance blocks.
 - b. The winners of each class be guaranteed a performance slot in finals OR offer an exhibition performance at finals for class winners that did not make finals on their own merit.
- 4) The current format for CBA Regionals, Semifinals, and Finals will remain the same as in previous years.
- 5) Beginning in 2024:
 - a. Class 1A, 2A, 3A will be scheduled in 13-minute time slots at all competitions that are scheduled by class. This includes CBA Sanctioned shows that are scheduled by class, CBA Regionals, all CBA Championship events.
 - b. ALL Open Class contests and Sanctioned show Finals will be scheduled in 15 minutes slots and 1A-3A Bands will not be penalized for going over 13 minutes.
 - c. The pre-staging time for bands in class 1A-3A be moved to 11min 30sec.
 - d. The entire grid of warm-up times, staging report times, etc. for 1A-3A will be based on a 13-minute slot rotation.
- 6) CBA Marching will make a commitment to director education in understanding the judging process at a higher level with a focus on clarifying the perceived areas of inequity in the judging process.

Attachments:

Meeting notes

Tafoya analysis

2023 Band staff comparison

2024 Scheduling considerations

2024 1A2A3A Semi-Finals 13-minute slots

Percentage of bands (participation change with 13-minute slots)

2023 Total Field Times 1A-3A