

CBA Classification Review Committee

Meeting Minutes - 3/5/24

1. Order: Rick Shaw called the meeting of the Colorado Bandmasters Association *Classification Review Committee* to order at 7:32pm.

2. Members Present: Trey Tafoya, Benjamin Corneliusen, Ryan Crabtree, WL Whaley; CBA Chief Judge, Rick Shaw; CBA Chairman of Marching Affairs, Sean Cartner, Aaron Herman, Becky Paschke; CBA President, Stoney Black, Bryce Melaragno

3. Beginning of Meeting:

- **Rick Shaw** summarized how he wanted to guide the meeting, discussing the CBA CRC data collection tool given at last meeting
- **Rick Shaw** emphasized CBA's philosophy on not dictating specifics on format of sanctioned shows

4. Main Discussion:

- **What thoughts do you have as to what a CBA sanctioned show could look like?**
 - **Sean Cartner:** Pro-variety for all shows - some schools can go on later one week, might also help judging panel. Could be interesting switch to move towards random block draw for classes.
 - **Becky Paschke:** Likes the Legend show, it is cool that different shows have different specialties that serve different purposes so the directors could change based on needs for their programs
 - **Stoney Black:** Some of these formats could be less profitable for certain venues, may be a show host decision and may affect their gate profits
 - **WL Whaley:** The show hosts take a big risk to host an event - if we are introducing that there is a chance they're out money due to gate profits, it is worth it to run it by show hosts and gathering opinions
 - **Rick Shaw:** Committee input is worthwhile but should not be the end-all decision. Show hosts are fronting the money, so data should be gathered from committee but ultimately should be agreed upon & negotiated with show hosts
 - **WL Whaley:** This would make rewarding bands who have previously done well in this show very difficult

- **Rick Shaw:** Combining this question alongside an open class model, this makes the 13-minute block for 1A-2A-3A impossible (we can't go 15-13-15-15-13-15 etc.)
- **Trey Tafoya:** Could we have 13 minute requirements for 1A-2A-3A within a 15 minute block (just having a 2 minute downtime, but judging time is within 13 min)?
- **WL Whaley:** This 13-minute block does not apply to Open Class shows. Only CBA-Sanctioned shows that organize by class. Open Class should all be 15 minute blocks
- **Becky Paschke:** That's the beauty of CBA shows - directors can strategically choose shows that will grow their programs. They can choose between open-class formats and class-divided formats
- **Sean Cartner:** We should make these selections available to show hosts, they can choose, and then have a variety of venues and time formats that then makes them more/less appealing to directors of all kinds
- **Trey Tafoya:** If there's a show that's by class, and then Open Class for Finals, would the Finals go to 15-minutes for 1A-2A-3A?
- **WL Whaley:** Yes - they have 2 extra minutes in ANYTHING Open Class
- **Recommendation to Show Hosts to take the top band from each class to Finals?**
 - **Trey Tafoya:** This would take opportunities away from a school that is deserving of that second performance
 - **Aaron Herman:** What is the likelihood that there would be more than 2 exhibitions (1A/2A)? Is it safe to assume that probably at least one 3A-4A-5A band make it to finals?
 - **WL Whaley:** Adding on any sort of recorded tape commentary adds a significant cost to the show host. It's true that there is probably a maximum of 2 Exhibition bands (1A/2A) that would not be in the top 12 in general. Adding 2 bands is another 30 minutes. Certain shows physically couldn't accommodate (painting lines on grass etc.), each show site would need to figure it out themselves
 - **Rick Shaw:** These are all just recommendations, not necessarily putting it on every show. Just options to show hosts to consider as we discuss. If they can accommodate, they will
- **What are your thoughts about changing sanctioned show block draws to groups of 8 rather than 4? Impact?**

- **Rick Shaw:** Let's determine the pros and cons of blind draws - currently we draw in blocks of 4.
- **Stoney Black:** BOA Reflections - when a band had a bad draw multiple years in a row, they always dropped in finals despite being ranked 1st due to 2 hours in between comparable bands. The further the bands are apart, the harder it is to compare the nuance and hold the number
- **Aaron Herman:** Randomizing everything would probably make the ups and downs of inconsistent scoring (and then having to explain to kids/community/etc) worse for the band as a whole
- **Rick Shaw:** I am against a full, random 16-band draw - it would change everything and how the scoring looks every week. It doesn't help anybody. What about a 6 band draw or a 4 band draw for scoring neighborhoods?
- **WL Whaley:** 6 is reasonable. Anything bigger is a joke (hard enough to remember with a 4 band draw). There's an hour or more difference between performance times. You're holding on to a couple key points regarding certain bands - copious notes to try to get bands in the right order. An 8 band block draw puts kids at risk. 6 is on the edge. The critical numbers are band 6 and 7 in a 6 band draw. It's important for us to be in the same neighborhood. We're not slotting bands based on when they go on. The band slots themselves with their score. However we block the groups - I think we've done a great job in Colorado - I would hate to break it for whatever reason.
- **Stoney Black:** I think this is a topic that falls under "Director Education" area - so they can best understand judges and how everything works. In talking to directors, something that needs to be learned is how judges think about this order and even reverse order in finals - comparing bands to bands and really getting a good feel from slot to slot.
- **Aaron Herman:** If CBA's mission is to show that we truly have some of the best of the best and do our research for judges, etc, we need to teach our directors to trust the process & how to understand it better
- **What about a 6 band draw vs. a 4 band draw?**
 - **Sean Cartner:** Changing to 6 won't necessarily make a big difference - not worth it after hearing comments from Stoney and others. It makes sense when we educate our directors about the process

- **Stoney Black:** I would prefer the 4 as a director and as a judge. The narrower you can make that neighborhood, the better it is for everyone.
- **Rick Shaw:** From what we're hearing, 4 band draw sounds like it is staying in place for CBA Sanction Shows, and Finals will remain as a reverse-order from Prelims
- **WL Whaley:** Would love to entertain a Director Training for understanding the adjudication process - good to do that with band parents too
- **With 1A-3A moving to 13 minute slots, should it be considered that all sanctioned shows follow suit?**
 - **Rick Shaw:** Philosophy behind this - to give more students the State experience. Made some models - would gain 2 bands per class for prelims (1A/2A/3A) - 6 bands total. Adding 1 band per each class to finals. This accomplishes our philosophy and goals. Still can't get to the same percentage of bands in 1A-3A as there are in 4A-5A, but we are climbing that direction.
 - **Benjamin Corneliusen:** What challenges would this pose to 1A-3A? Or better asked, how is this affecting current 1A-3A bands - how many are over 13 minute mark anyway?
 - **WL Whaley:** It currently affects maybe 3 3A bands, 1 2A band, and no 1A bands.
 - **Benjamin Corneliusen:** This would be a significant data dive, but is it worthwhile to gather data regarding averages and lengths of 1A-3A Regional shows to pose to 1A-3A directors and show that it supports 90+% of bands in these classifications?
 - **WL Whaley:** Several factors that affect that number
 - **Rick Shaw:** Will touch base with Craig Ketels and see if we can start getting some data on that to feel better
- **Quarter Finals format?**
 - **Rick Shaw:** Data was all over - some for no change, some for random draw of 4, some for reverse order, etc. It leans towards keeping it the way it is or random draws of 4
 - **Bryce Melaragno:** Did Marching Committee discuss this/propose at December meeting?
 - Yes - Daniel Evans proposal to make Quarter Finals like Semi & Finals in a blind draw in blocks of 4

- Was voted down and motion approved - *no change* at Marching Affairs mtg. in December

- **Semi Finals & Finals format?**

- **Rick Shaw:** Would like to keep this the same and the format that has worked for years

- **No objections - no change**

- **WL Whaley:** Still keeping auto-qualifiers from Regionals

5. Wrap-Up:

- **Stoney Black:** One strength of CBA is the consistency of judging, format, rules, and regulations throughout the season and from show to show. This cannot be said for other states and circuits around the country. We should be careful not to damage that consistency that is currently built into the system.

- **Rick Shaw:** We need more director education. WL & I will work on that for the summer convention. We need a direction for the 13-minute slots for 1A-3A, with considerations to sanctioned shows, and we are moving in a direction that will solidify that - but we need to make a decision very soon - I feel that we are really close.

6. Adjournment: Rick Shaw adjourned the meeting of the Colorado Bandmasters Association *Classification Review Committee* at 9:01pm.